

## **COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE RIGHT TO WORK IN THE EUROPEAN SPACE FOR ROMANIAN AND MOLDOVAN CITIZENS**

**OANA RĂVAȘ \***

**ABSTRACT:** *Free movement of labor allows countries whose populations face social problems: lack of employment, low wages, poor working conditions, to emigrate in search of a job and better livelihoods than in the country native. Romania and the Republic of Moldova are among the countries whose citizens choose to leave their country, their family for a job abroad. That is why it is very important that every citizen who travels in order to work in the territory of the Member States is aware of his or her rights, obligations and responsibilities. This allows them to work under the conditions provided by law, to be remunerated according to the work performed and to enjoy social rights, equal treatment and non-discrimination in the workplace.*

**KEY WORDS:** *labor, work, rights, responsabilitates, unemployment, migration, wage.*

**JEL CLASSIFICATIONS:** *J71, J83, K10.*

### **1. COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF THE RIGHT TO WORK FOR ROMANIAN AND MOLDOVAN CITIZENS FROM A STATISTICAL POINT OF VIEW**

Trying to make a comparative analysis of the right to work in the European space for Moldovan and Romanian citizens, I found more differences than similarities, the similarities being the reasons that determine both Romanian and Moldovan citizens to go abroad.

The large number of citizens leaving is also a resemblance between the two countries. Romania is a country of emigration, every year the number of Romanian citizens who leave the country increases. According to statistical data, the number of Romanian citizens abroad for at least 12 months residing in Romania was on January 1, 2013 of approximately 2.3 million people.

---

\*Lecturer, Ph.D., University of Petroșani, [oana.ravas@gmail.com](mailto:oana.ravas@gmail.com)

**Table 1. Number of Romanian emigrants by sex groups**

	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013
<b>Total</b>	1922805	2135691	2234155	2241263	2341263	2344183
<b>Male</b>	1041256	1149822	1192763	1213082	1232536	1196324
<b>Feminine</b>	881549	985869	1041392	1075449	1108727	1147859

According to the statistical data presented, there is a tendency to equalize the share of emigrants based on sex, if in 2008 the number of men abroad far exceeded the number of women, in 2013 the number of women reaches approximately the same level. It is observed that in 2013 the migration among men decreased, but the number of women is not higher in the total share of Romanians abroad, the percentage being about 51% in favor of men. The number of women who have left in recent years is justified by the large number of jobs for women. The migration of women in particular also has a negative effect on the personal life of couples, also in Romania the woman is considered the protector of the home, it negatively influences the harsh way in which children grow up. However, this is an aspect of the social that deserves a broad analysis.

**Table 2. Annual growth rat**

	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013
<b>Annual growth rate</b>	11.1%	4.6%	2.4%	2.3%	0.1%

There is a decrease in the annual growth rate from 11.1% in 2009 to 0.1% in 2013, compared to January 1, 2008 the number of Romanian citizens increased by 21.9%, although the annual growth rate of the number of citizens who leaves shrink. A big wave of emigrations was registered in 2007 when Romanian citizens became European citizens, also a big wave of emigrations was registered after the revolution, when Romania became a democratic country and emigration was not restricted.

**Table 3. Persons abroad on January 1, 2013, by age groups**

	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013
<b>Total</b>	1922805	2135691	2234155	2288531	2341263	2344183
<b>Under 15 years</b>	193188	210608	208870	203844	198075	338874
<b>15-19 years</b>	134381	123060	110854	103480	102966	96728
<b>20-24 years</b>	301696	330252	328348	309334	283380	208193
<b>25-29 years</b>	359595	379433	380482	377780	375133	354192
<b>30-34 years</b>	308984	356349	381021	392938	401346	378559
<b>35-39 years</b>	250966	268361	283291	298926	317788	324829
<b>40-44 years</b>	136657	180768	214724	241658	267516	255432
<b>45-49 years</b>	108163	121711	128761	133407	137208	154832
<b>50-54 years</b>	73032	90843	104389	112345	120251	112400

<b>55-59 years</b>	33.687	44.327	54.350	65.365	76.656	72.094
<b>60 years and over</b>	22.456	29.979	39.065	49.364	60.951	47.889

It can be seen that depending on the age group, more than half of the Romanians abroad are between 20 and 44 years old, which negatively influences the demographic situation of the country and the labor force. There is also an increase in the number of the population under the age of 15, if in 2008 there were 193,188 people, in 2013 the number reaches 338,874, these figures being justified by the fact that most people who migrate are of family more Romanian citizens abroad become parents and raise their children in a country other than Romania, while in Romania the birth rate decreases, there is the phenomenon of aging population.

Also, in addition to the decrease in the birth rate, the migration of the population between 20 and 44 years old influences the decrease of the well-prepared and higher education workforce. Mass migration, which took place in a very short time and among the able-bodied population, unbalanced the domestic labor market, registering large imbalances in certain sectors and economic branches.

An example of migration among able-bodied, well-trained people is the migration of Romanian doctors, being a widespread phenomenon. Romanian doctors are highly sought after in recruitments made by European countries. According to statistics, about 3,000 doctors left Romania in 2013, negatively influencing the Romanian health system. The choice to leave the country by Romanian doctors is justified by low salaries and inefficient health system, being appreciated for professionalism, properly paid prefer to practice in countries such as: Germany, United Kingdom, Netherlands

**Table 4. Romanian citizens abroad by country of residence on January 1, 2013**

	<b>2008</b>	<b>2009</b>	<b>2010</b>	<b>2011</b>	<b>2012</b>	<b>2013</b>
<b>Total</b>	1922805	2135691	2234155	2288531	2341263	2344183
<b>Austria</b>	27646	32269	35962	41739	47435	53473
<b>Belgium</b>	15310	21403	26383	34178	42927	51295
<b>Germany</b>	90614	100429	112230	135707	171612	219117
<b>Greece</b>	25735	29456	33773	33346	30,000	30,000
<b>Italy</b>	625278	796477	887763	968576	1072342	951104
<b>UK</b>	19,000	32,000	52,000	75572	94825	105273
<b>Spain</b>	734764	764391	770385	783230	798969	769609
<b>Hungary</b>	65903	66435	72781	76878	41569	34795
<b>Other countries</b>	318555	292804	242878	139305	41557	12951

## **2. ROMANIAN LABOR MIGRATION**

You can see the large number of Romanian citizens in Italy and Spain, over one million Romanians were on January 1, 2013 in the two countries. Although in recent years the number of Romanians leaving the two states due to the crisis and the

very high unemployment rate has decreased, most Romanians remain there due to those who left before Romania's accession to the European Union and during the first years after accession, Italy being one of the countries that eliminated the restrictions imposed on Romanian citizens before the expiration of the seven-year term, imposed on Romania as a newly acceded country.

The downward trend is also observed among Romanians leaving for Greece and Hungary. The public debt crisis in Greece, due to the global economic crisis, has reduced the number of Romanians working in Greece.

The number of Romanian citizens in Germany, Austria, Belgium, Great Britain has increased considerably. Although in the United Kingdom, when you get hired, a lot of documents are needed, Romanians are increasingly attracted to the English labor market. High salaries, the fact that English is known by many Romanians is the motivation to choose Great Britain as the country where they work. However, after the exit vote following the referendum organized on June 23 by the citizens of Great Britain, the situation could change, and the number of Romanian citizens who want to access the English labor market could decrease.

Austria and Belgium are countries that maintained the restrictions for Romanian citizens until January 1, 2014, however, even there the annual growth rate of the number of Romanian citizens working in the two countries increased considerably, one reason, in addition to the advantages in terms of financially, it would be the reorientation of Romanian citizens who were working in Italy and Spain.

Also, there is currently a trend of migration of the Romanian labor force to the Nordic countries: Finland, Norway, Sweden, Denmark. Most employers in the Nordic countries are looking for skilled workers who know English. Most offers for the Norwegian labor market for example are: engineers, carpenters, carpenters, electricians. Romanians employed in the Nordic countries are remunerated with a gross salary of 3,500 euros per month. A considerable advantage is the knowledge of the language of the country that chooses it as a destination for a job.

Most Romanians work in various fields, such as agriculture, construction, elderly care, hotel services and restaurants.

The lack of updated and unofficial data was an impediment in the presentation of statistical data, it is also a problem for estimating the real number of Romanian citizens abroad, the estimates are based on opinion polls conducted in Romania and in the main destination countries. The statistical data presented are taken from a study on the number of migrant citizens and are indicative and provisional. (4)

The Republic of Moldova is as affected by the migration phenomenon as Romania, most citizens who choose to leave the country are in the category of able-bodied citizens. According to statistics, about 40% of working Moldovans go abroad, out of 3.5 million people about 400 thousand go to work abroad, according to official statistics, the number being much higher unofficially. (5)

The migration of the able-bodied population has a negative influence on the development of the labor market in the country. In addition to the negative effects, it also has positive effects, the money sent supports the national economy, being 20% of the total gross domestic product.

**Table 5. Number of Moldovan emigrants by sex groups**

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
<b>Total</b>	311,000	316.900	328.300	332.500	341.900	325.400
<b>Male</b>	198,000	204.400	218.600	216.900	219,000	210.800
<b>feminine</b>	113,000	112,500	109.700	115.600	122.800	114.600

It is possible to observe the tendency of massive emigration among men, approximately 2/3 of the emigrants are men, unlike the Romanian citizens where in 2013 the emigration according to sex had the tendency of equalization. The number of women who left in 2013 was even higher than that of men but did not exceed the total number of men currently employed in European countries.

Mass emigration among men is explained by the fact that almost half of Moldovan citizens work in the CIS member states, including Russia, and there are jobs for men: technical staff, construction, interior design, transport. There is also a steady annual increase in the number of Moldovan citizens leaving, 2014 being the year with the most Moldovans abroad.

2014 was the year when the Republic of Moldova received free access to the European Union, but only for tourism purposes, for a limited period of time, without the right to work.

**Table 6. Moldovan citizens abroad, by age groups**

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
<b>Total</b>	311000	316900	328300	332500	341900	325400
<b>15-24 years</b>	69000	71200	72100	69100	72300	60600
<b>25-34 years</b>	102200	105900	111300	111700	121200	125800
<b>35-44 years</b>	68600	65800	72500	74600	71600	70300
<b>45-54 years</b>	58300	58700	59400	61300	59900	50600
<b>55-64 years</b>	12200	15500	17200	15500	17200	17400
<b>65 years and over</b>	0	two hundred	two hundred	two hundred	500	700

One of the emigration tendencies is represented by the young age of the emigrants, an aspect similar to the migration according to the age group of the Romanian citizens. As among Romanian citizens, most Moldovan citizens abroad are between 15 and 44 years old. The migration of the young population has a negative influence on the labor market in the country.

**Table 7. Migration of Moldovan citizens according to destination country**

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
<b>Total</b>	311000	316900	328300	332500	341900	325400
<b>Greece</b>	2500	2400	1600	1600	2000	1400
<b>Israel</b>	8200	6400	7900	7100	8400	9200
<b>Italy</b>	58600	58400	54800	50700	49600	49200

<b>Portugal</b>	5100	4400	3200	4100	2000	2400
<b>Romania</b>	2300	2400	300	3500	3800	2700
<b>Russia</b>	191900	204800	223400	223600	232800	206200
<b>Turkey</b>	9000	7400	5800	7500	11100	11000
<b>Ukraine</b>	6500	5100	3900	5400	4600	4600
<b>Other countries</b>	26900	25600	24100	28900	38700	38700

### 3. MOLDOVAN LABOR MIGRATION

In the case of the comparative analysis between the Romanian citizens and the Moldovan citizens according to the criterion of the destination country, significant differences are found. If Romanian citizens are distributed in most European countries, Italy and Spain having the largest share, Moldovan citizens are attracted by the CIS, countries such as Russia and Ukraine, as well as countries outside the European Union such as Israel and Turkey, and from within the European Union, the largest number of Moldovans are in Italy, Portugal and Greece.

Russia is an attractive labor market for Moldovan citizens due to the low costs required to reach their desired destination, an advantage is the lack of bureaucratic formalities, Moldovan citizens can travel without a visa to Russia, and in case of employment they receive a permit work for which a fee is paid.

Another advantage in choosing Russia is the knowledge of the Russian language by the Moldovan citizens, ensuring them an easier adaptation. In recent years, starting with 2013, mass deportations of Moldovan migrants who worked illegally began, and this aspect is observed in the official figures presented. If in 2014 the number of Moldovan citizens in Russia was 232,800, in 2015 it reached 206,200.

Ukraine is preferred for the same reasons as Russia, except that lately the number of Moldovan citizens working in Ukraine has also decreased or remained at the same level, due to the existing conflict that causes many Moldovan citizens to avoid Ukraine. With Turkey and Israel, the Republic of Moldova has concluded treaties regulating the right to work for Moldovan citizens, who enjoy social protection on the territory of the two states.

In the case of European countries, seconded for the purpose of preferences is Italy. Over 50,000 Moldovans work in Italy, and this number is approximate and official, the unofficial data are much higher. Between Moldova and Italy were end its several agreements, the last in pensions which allows Moldovan citizens who have worked legally in Italy and paid contributions to the pension fund to receive pensions upon reaching retirement age.

Many of the Moldovan citizens who are now in the European workplace have left illegally and during the period when large sums of money were paid to get a job. Unofficially, during the years 2005, Moldovans paid up to 3,000 euros to get a job in Europe.

Currently, Moldovans are in most European countries: Germany, the Netherlands, France, Great Britain, Spain. Being much better informed and knowing

much better their rights and responsibilities. Many Moldovans also take advantage of their time as tourists to access a job and complete all legal formalities.

The statistical data presented regarding Moldovan citizens are official data, taken from the website of the National Bureau of Statistics of the Republic of Moldova. Statistics on labor migration in the Republic of Moldova are quite controversial and often do not present the real situation. The figures vary depending on the surveys conducted and also an essential factor that influences the presentation of the real number, is the undeclared work of Moldovan citizens, many of the Moldovan citizens agree to work illegally.

From a statistical point of view, there are similarities between Moldovan and Romanian citizens in terms of age, in both cases it is between 15-44 years, the average age being about 30 years. Similarities are also the reasons that determine the citizens of the two countries to migrate in search of a job. These reasons in both cases are:

- job loss in the country and lack of new jobs, the unemployment rate has a high level in both countries, according to the National Bureau of Statistics, the unemployment rate in the Republic of Moldova reaches the level of 6.2% these being official data, unofficially around 10% of the working population does not have a job. Romania has registered an unemployment rate of 6.7% according to data provided by Eurostat;
- the low salary level, the average gross salary in Romania is 2681 lei being one of the lowest in Europe, while in the Republic of Moldova the average gross salary per economy is 5050 Moldovan lei, being close to the level of the minimum wage per economy in Romania;

Another reason for the emigration of the labor force of Romanian and Moldovan citizens is the departure to study in European countries, which offers the subsequent possibility of employment. Many Romanian students choose the UK for their studies, while Moldovans prefer Romania;

- Moldovan and Romanian citizens are also influenced by the political and social situation, in addition to the economic one. Political instability is a feature of the Republic of Moldova, Romania is also affected by this situation;
- corruption, bureaucracy being also a factor influencing mass migration of labor.

The differences between the two states in the field of labor migration of Moldovan and Romanian citizens are observed in the choice of destination country. If most Romanian citizens prefer exclusively the European Union, most Moldovan citizens work in Russia. In the case of European countries, Italy is the country where most Moldovans are, as well as most Romanian citizens.

#### **4. CONCLUSIONS**

Labor migration in the European space should not be approached as a negative phenomenon, which has a decreasing influence on the demographics of Romania and the Republic of Moldova. Labor migration to the country of origin lowers the unemployment rate, which leads to higher wages, there is economic growth through the transfer of migrants' incomes, many migrants tend to return to the country invest

the money they get and implement improved skills. For the destination country, migration also has a positive effect by increasing the number of human resources, a developed country will always need external labor. Therefore, in addition to the negative aspects, labor migration has a positive aspect for both parties.

The state of origin should use all possible tools to protect its migrant citizens, both illegally and legally abroad. Campaigns must be made to inform citizens who wish to leave or who already have the right to work. Information campaigns would allow a better knowledge of all aspects related to the right to work and to know the ways of employment, the ways in which one can benefit from social programs.

Romania and the Republic of Moldova must implement programs to support citizens who want to return, so there would be motivation to return to the country.

#### REFERENCES:

- [1]. **Gîlcă, C.** (2012) *Drept Comunitar al muncii. Transpunerea în dreptul muncii român*, Editura Rosetti Internațional
- [2]. **Voiculescu, N.** (2009) *Drept comunitar al muncii*, Editura Wolters Kluwer
- [3]. **Rusu, E.; Catan, T.** (2009) *Gestionarea migrației de muncă în Republica Moldova. Studii*, Editura Chișinău
- [4]. **Samoilă, T.** (2009) *Gestionarea migrației de muncă în Republica Moldova. Studii*, Editura Chișinău
- [5]. Directive No. 68/360 / EEC concerning the rights of entry and residence, published in the Official Journal of the European Union legislation (referred to as OJ L) 257 of October 19, 1968
- [6]. Directive No. 64/221 / EEC on the right of Member States to derogate from free movement on grounds of public policy, public security or public health, published in OJ L 56 of April 4, 1964
- [7]. Directive nr.2004 / 38 / EC on the right of free circulation right and reside freely within the Member States for Union citizens and their family members, published in OJ L 158 of 30 April 2004
- [8]. Directive 2009 / 50CEE of 29 May 2009 on entry and exit of third country nationals to fill
- [9]. Directive 2004/114 / EC of 13 December 2004 on the conditions of admission of third-country nationals for studies, student exchange, training
- [10]. Regulation no.1251 / 70 / EEC on the right to remain in the territory of a Member State by engaging in that State, published in OJ L 142 of June 30, 1970
- [11]. Council Regulation (EEC) No. 1612/68 on free movement of workers within the Community
- [12]. Regulation nr.1612 / 68 / EEC on access to employment conditions, published in OJ L 257 of October 19, 1968
- [13]. Council Regulation (EEC) No. 1612/68 on free movement of workers within the Community, published in OJ L 257 of 15 October 1968
- [14]. Regulation no. 539/2001 laying down the list of third countries whose nationals must be in possession of a visa or crossing the external borders of the EU published in OJ L 105
- [15]. Statistical Body of the European Commission
- [16]. [www.europarl.europa.eu](http://www.europarl.europa.eu) ( july, 2016)
- [17]. [www.eur-lex.europa.eu](http://www.eur-lex.europa.eu) ( july, 2016)